COUNTY SERVICES COMMITTEE
August 23, 2018
Minutes

Members Present: Celentino, Hope, Grebner, Naeyaert, Nolan, Maiville, and Sebolt

Members Absent: None

Others Present: Register Derrick Quinney, Rick Terrill, Deb Fett, Jill Rhode, Matt Nordfjord, Bill Conklin, Jim Hudgins, Cynthia Wagner, Sheldon Lewis, Michelle Beloskur, Ryan Buck, Michael Townsend, Jared Cypher, Terri Morton, Tim Dolehanty, Craig Hoffman, Sue Graham, Becky Bennett, Lindsey LaForte and others

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Nolan at 6:30 p.m. in Personnel Conference Room “D & E” of the Human Services Building, 5303 S. Cedar Street, Lansing, Michigan.

Additions to the Agenda

1. Budget Hearings
   u. Ingham Conservation District

Limited Public Comment

Michelle Beloskur, Ingham Conservation District, stated that she had an update since she was last before the Committee. She further stated that she wanted to highlight the number of federal dollars coming into Ingham County for conservation last year, which was over $557,000.

Ms. Beloskur stated that the invasive species unit was running well and they had over $300,000 in State funds to help that program.

Ms. Beloskur stated that the used tire collecting event was on June 23, 2018 and they had collected over 1,000 tires at the Road Department’s facility. She further mentioned that they were in the 10th year of stream monitoring and now had a nice amount of data.

Commissioner Grebner asked what they were measuring when monitoring the stream.

Ms. Beloskur stated that they monitored macro invertebrates.

Chairperson Nolan stated that the Committee would start with all the agencies that approved the recommended budget, and then review the remaining agency budgets one by one.
Chairperson Nolan asked those Departments or affiliated entity representatives that were satisfied with their pieces of the Controller’s Recommended Budget to stand.

The following representatives stated they were satisfied with their piece of the Controller’s Recommended Budget:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Representative</th>
<th>Department or Affiliated Entity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jill Rhode</td>
<td>Financial Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rick Terrill</td>
<td>Facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Becky Bennett</td>
<td>Equalization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cynthia Wagner</td>
<td>Potter Park Zoo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bill Conklin</td>
<td>Road Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Becky Bennett</td>
<td>Board of Commissioners and Advisory Boards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Craig Hoffman</td>
<td>Tri-County Regional Planning Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Derick Quinney</td>
<td>Register of Deeds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim Hudgins</td>
<td>Purchasing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matt Nordfjord</td>
<td>County Attorney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheldon Lewis</td>
<td>Drain Commissioner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sue Graham</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michelle Beloskur</td>
<td>Ingham Conservation District</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(2)
Commissioner Hope asked if they had received the budget books later than normal.

Teri Morton, Deputy Controller, stated that it was within the range of the budget calendar.

Commissioner Hope stated that having only received it two days ago, it seemed later than usual.

Ms. Morton stated that she could look and see how it compared to last year.

Commissioner Celentino asked if the Treasurer’s Office was happy with their budget.

Chairperson Nolan stated that the Treasurer was not present at tonight’s meeting.

Tim Dolechanty, Controller, stated that they had not heard from the Treasurer about any concerns.

Deb Fett, Innovation and Technology Department Director, stated that she was happy overall with the budget and appreciated having one additional staff member added in the Controller’s recommendations. She further stated that she was before the Committee to ask for another position to be placed on the Z list.

Ms. Fett stated that they needed another analyst on staff to help with applications and that this would save money in the long term. She further stated that her current staff did not have time to perform these functions now.

Ms. Fett stated that the cost was $136,133 at the highest level. She further stated that she requested consideration of this additional position.

Chairperson Nolan asked if this was the first year that IT was asking for this position.

Ms. Fett answered yes.

Commissioner Celentino asked the Controller if they had budgeted $300,000 for the Z-list.

Mr. Dolechanty stated the Z-list had been given $300,000.

Commissioner Celentino stated they were the first Committee and had the full amount to work with.

Chairperson Nolan stated that this was a big ask.

Ms. Fett stated that it was but she felt that it was needed.

MOVED BY COMM. GREBNER TO ADD AN ADDITIONAL IT ANALYST POSITION TO THE Z-LIST.

THE MOTION FAILED DUE TO LACK OF SUPPORT.
Commissioner Maiville asked Ms. Fett if there had been additional staff given to IT in the 2019 budget.

Ms. Fett stated that she was given one additional position in the Controller’s recommended budget. She further stated that she had requested three additional positions but just having two would make a big difference.

Ryan Buck, Chief Deputy County Clerk, stated that Clerk Barb Byrum was hoping to attend the meeting but had a family event to attend first. He further stated that he was before the Committee in order to ask for two additional full time Deputy County Clerks.

Mr. Buck stated that the Clerk had been requesting additional staff for a while. He further stated that the Deputy Clerks did not want to take time off because it left the office short staffed and that they found it difficult to do additional training.

Mr. Buck stated that often managers were helping the Deputy Clerks with customers and that it was a situation that would eventually lead to a grievance. He further stated that the Lansing Office closes for 1.5 hours each day because of lack of coverage.

Mr. Buck stated that the Clerk’s Office had a lot of additional responsibilities with changes such as filing contracts. He further stated that the Bureau of Elections at the Secretary of State was now recommending that all of the recall petitions be reviewed by the County Clerk’s Office, not municipal clerks. Mr. Buck stated that right now with the Williamston School Board Recall they were working on checking 4,500 signatures.

Mr. Buck stated that the Federal Real ID Act has led to many customers needing to have a copy of their birth or marriage records in order to renew their driver’s license with the Secretary of State.

Mr. Buck stated that the Clerk’s Office was comprised of a staff of 11 and covered three office locations. He further stated that this request would allow an additional Deputy Clerk in the Lansing Office and an additional Deputy Clerk in the Mason Office.

Mr. Buck stated that these positions would cost $151,026 at the top end for both combined. He further stated that if broken down, it would be $75,513 per employee in 2019 numbers.

Commissioner Grebner stated that he often was at the Lansing Office and had noticed that the Clerk’s Office and Treasurer’s Office no longer helped to cover the other’s work. He further stated that he had asked about cross training between the Clerk and the Treasurer and was told that they could not count on the other to care of simple tasks for the other.

Mr. Buck stated that was true that they were no longer cross training with the Treasurer’s Office.

Commissioner Grebner stated that the Treasurer’s staff stated that it would not be difficult to start to cross train again.
Mr. Buck stated that some of what was done by the Clerk’s Office was simply receiving of files, but they also needed to process some things further and provide records. He further stated that they did not feel that the Clerk’s Office had been getting an equal level of support from the Treasurer’s Office as they had been providing.

Mr. Buck stated that the Lansing Office was always staffed by the Clerk’s Office, even if someone was on vacation. He further stated that the Treasurer’s Office would close the window if they were on vacation.

Mr. Buck stated that the relationship was not working.

Chairperson Nolan stated that was not good.

Commissioner Sebolt asked the Chairperson to clarify her comment.

Chairperson Nolan stated that it was unfortunate that the Clerk’s Office and Treasurer’s Office could not make the relationship work.

Commissioner Sebolt stated that it was unfortunate but there were so many issues with the Treasurer’s Office he was not sure that they needed to also be handling the Clerk’s Office responsibilities.

Commissioner Grebner stated that he had not heard complaints about the Treasurer’s Office mishandling anything for the Clerk’s Office.

Commissioner Sebolt stated that they just heard complaints that the relationship was not working.

Commissioner Grebner stated that there was a vague mention of an issue. He asked Mr. Buck if there had been written complaints.

Mr. Buck stated that he was not able to answer that question.

Commissioner Grebner stated that of course he could not answer. He further stated that there were problems at the management level in the Treasurer’s Office but it did not mean that they could not help with simple paperwork.

Commissioner Sebolt stated that the Treasurer’s Office having an employee absent in the Lansing Office and leaving that office closed was an issue.

Mr. Buck stated that he wanted to clarify why he could not answer these questions. He further stated that this was an open meeting and what he is being asked related to personnel issues Mr. Buck stated that he would want to discuss such a matter with Clerk Byrum and the Human Resources Director first.

Commissioner Grebner stated that the Treasurer’s Office was very small and did not have staff to move to Lansing when the Lansing staff was absent. He further stated that there was a time when
they needed to hand out checks to witnesses in some case and could not do that through the Clerk’s Office.

Commissioner Grebner stated that this change was a blow to the quality of service that residents receive. He further stated that there was potential for a service disruption for days at a time.

Mr. Buck stated that the Clerk only closes for 1.5 hours a day while their Deputy Clerk took two 15 minute breaks and an hour long lunch.

**Commissioner Grebner stated that he would like a memo discussing the issues with cross training.** He further stated that departments with adjacent counters and similar work product should be able to work together.

Chairperson Nolan asked how long it had been since this change to not work cooperatively.

Mr. Buck stated that in October 2016 there had been a reassignment of Clerk staff and at that time the Deputy Clerk in Lansing was not trained in Treasurer duties.

Chairperson Nolan stated that it was unfortunate and affects many citizens in the population center.

Commissioner Grebner stated that it seemed that the only way to cover windows at all times was by adding employees. He further stated that this issue did not necessarily require a full time employee.

Commissioner Grebner stated that the County could get more bang for their buck by getting the departments to work together.

Commissioner Naeyaert asked if there was any way to get at least one of these Deputy Clerk positions back in the budget.

Chairperson Nolan stated that they could vote on it.

Commissioner Naeyaert stated that the Clerk had a lot of responsibilities. She further stated that the Clerk comes every year to ask for additional staff and Commissioner Naeyaert was supportive of this.

**MOVED BY COMM. GREBNER, SUPPORTED BY COMM. NOLAN, TO ADD AN IT ANALYST POSITION TO THE Z-LIST.**

Commissioner Naeyaert stated that the IT Department had already had an additional staff person in the Controller’s recommended budget. She further stated that position should help alleviate some of the workload.

Commissioner Naeyaert stated that one position was needed, but she was not in supportive of another additional person at this time.
Commissioner Grebner stated that the question was not about fairness and that he did not believe in fairness to departments when it came to the budget. He further stated that it was about what was the best bang for buck.

Commissioner Grebner stated that they needed to consider how the taxpayers could best get services. He further stated that this was a long term project to bring the IT Department up to date.

Commissioner Grebner stated that the County had been an exemplar of trailing edge technology and they needed to put more money into IT. He further stated that there should be lots of Z-list items to give Finance a lot to decide.

Commissioner Celentino stated that if the Committee approved all three positions requested tonight for the Z-list, the cost would be about $213,000. He further stated that he supported putting everything on the Z-list and giving some stress to the Finance Committee.

Commissioner Celentino stated that he was supportive of the Clerk having an additional Deputy Clerk for the Lansing Office which was critical for himself and his constituents. He further stated that it was very convenient to go downtown, especially for his constituents that had limited transportation access.

Commissioner Celentino stated that the Committee could put everything on the Z-list and they would still be under $300,000.

Chairperson Nolan stated that the motion that they were speaking to only considered the IT position.

THE MOTION CARRIED BY ROLL CALL VOTE.    Yeas: Celentino, Hope, Grebner, Naeyaert, Nolan, and Maiville
                                                  Nay: Sebolt
                                                  Absent: None

Discussion.

MOVED BY COMM. CELENTINO, SUPPORTED BY COMM. SEBOLT, TO ADD TWO DEPUTY CLERK POSITIONS FOR THE CLERK’S OFFICE TO THE Z-LIST.

COMM. GREBNER ASKED THAT THE QUESTION BE DIVIDED.

Commissioner Hope asked Mr. Buck how this affected the Circuit Court.

Mr. Buck stated that earlier he had spoken about the Clerk’s Office covering three locations which included the Circuit Court Clerk’s Office, the Lansing Office, and the Mason Office. He further stated that the Clerk’s staff included two manager positions at the Circuit Court Clerk’s Office, four Deputy Clerks at the Mason Office, one Deputy Clerk at the Lansing Office, and the Recording Secretary, Elections Clerk Coordinator, Chief Deputy County Clerk at the Mason Office.

Mr. Buck stated that counting the Clerk, that there was a staff of 11 at present.

(7)
THE DIVIDED MOTION, SPECIFICALLY TO ADD ONE DEPUTY COUNTY CLERK POSITION TO THE Z-LIST, CARRIED.  
**Yea**: Celentino, Hope, Grebner, Naeyaert, Sebolt, and Maiville  
**Nay**: Nolan  
**Absent**: None.

THE DIVIDED MOTION, SPECIFICALLY TO ADD THE SECOND DEPUTY COUNTY CLERK POSITION TO THE Z-LIST, CARRIED.  
**Yea**: Celentino, Hope, Naeyaert, Sebolt, and Maiville  
**Nay**: Nolan and Grebner  
**Absent**: None.

2. **Final Ranking**

MOVED BY COMM. SEBOLT, SUPPORTED BY COMM. HOPE, TO RANK THE Z-LIST AS FOLLOWS:

   1. DEPUTY CLERK
   2. DEPUTY CLERK
   3. IT ANALYST

THE MOTION CARRIED BY ROLL CALL VOTE.  
**Yea**: Celentino, Hope, Naeyaert, Sebolt, and Maiville  
**Nay**: Nolan and Grebner  
**Absent**: None.

MOVED BY COMM. HOPE, SUPPORTED BY COMM. CELENTINO, TO APPROVE THE CONTROLLER’S RECOMMENDED BUDGET FOR ALL AGENCIES LISTED.

THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

**Announcements**

None.

**Public Comment**

None.

**Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 7:04 p.m.

BARB BYRUM, CLERK OF THE BOARD